

JOHN COOPER  
MAYOR



## METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park  
3000 Granny White Pike  
Nashville, Tennessee 37204  
Telephone: (615) 862-7970

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

1309 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North

August 19, 2020

**Application:** New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

**District:** Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

**Council District:** 19

**Base Zoning:** MUN

**Map and Parcel Number:** 08209004100

**Applicant:** Brady Frye, Contractor

**Project Lead:** Sean Alexander, sean.alexander@nashville.gov

<p><b>Description of Project:</b> Requesting approval of a tan exterior brick and black metal roof on an infill and an outbuilding project that is currently being constructed. Material selections were conditions of the approval of the project in the decision of the MHZC on March 20, 2019.</p> <p><b>Recommendation Summary:</b> Staff recommends that the installed black roof color shall be approved. Staff recommends that the brick shall be stained a red color more compatible with the colors of surrounding historic houses, with the color selection to be approved by MHZC staff prior to application.</p>	<p><b>Attachments</b> <b>A:</b> Photographs</p>
--	---

## Vicinity Map:



## Aerial Map:



## **Applicable Design Guidelines:**

### **III. New Construction**

#### **E. DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION IN ALL ZONES**

##### **1. General Policy**

- a. This section provides design guidelines for all new construction. Additional guidance is provided based on the Building Type proposed and the Development Zone in which the project will be located.
- b. Guidelines apply only to the exterior of new construction. Public facades shall be more carefully reviewed than non-public facades. Public facades are visible from the public right-of-way, street, alley or greenway. Non-public facades are not visible from the public right-of-way, street, alley, or greenway.
- c. Construction in the District has taken place continuously from the mid-19th century through the present and a variety of building styles and building types have resulted. This variety reflects the style, culture, and values of the District over time. New construction that imitates historic architectural styles may compromise the value of authentic historic structures by confusing genuine history with reproduction. Exterior building design should avoid the creation of themed environments that create a false sense of being in an alternate time or place. The architectural building types of new buildings should be appropriate to the general context of the historic portions of the neighborhood but may be contemporary in design.
- d. Because new buildings should relate to an established pattern and rhythm of existing buildings as viewed along both the same and opposite sides of a street, a dominance of the pattern and rhythm should be respected and not be disrupted.
- e. New construction should be consistent and compatible with existing buildings along a street in terms of height, scale, setback, relationship of materials, texture and color; roof shape; orientation; and proportion and rhythm of openings.

##### **5. Materials**

- a. The relationship and use of materials, texture, details and material color of a new building shall be visually compatible with and similar to or shall not contrast conspicuously with those of adjacent historic buildings.
- b. The MHZC does not review paint color on wood. The MHZC reviews the inherent color of new materials, such as masonry and metal. Generally, painting masonry materials is inappropriate for existing and new construction.
- c. The color of masonry should be similar to historic colors of the same or similar materials. Traditional brick colors range from red-oranges to dark red. The use of "antique" reproduction or multi-colored brick is not permitted.
- d. Materials not listed in section e and f may be appropriate, if they possess characteristics similar in scale, design, finish, texture, durability, workability and detailing to historic materials and meet The Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- e. Foundation Materials:

- Appropriate materials: brick, limestone, pre-cast stone if of a compatible color and texture to existing historic stone clad structures in the district, split-face concrete block, parge-coated concrete block
  - Inappropriate materials: dry-stack stone and “rubble stone” veneers
  - Intervening spaces of pier foundations may be filled with an open lattice work.
  - Slab-on-grade foundations may be appropriate for commercial building types but they are generally not appropriate for residential building types.
- f. Facade Materials:
- All facades shall be at least 80% brick. Appropriate accent materials include stucco, fiber-cement or metal panels, fiber-cement, milled and painted wood, or metal horizontal siding. A greater percentage of accent materials may be used on facades that are not visible from a public right-of-way. A greater percentage of accent materials may be appropriate to create a more varied and appropriately neighborhood scaled building façade and massing with the Werthan and Rosa Parks Development zone.
  - Lap and horizontal siding should have reveals that do not exceed 5”.
  - Inappropriate materials: T-1-11-type building panels, “permastone”, E.F.I.S., vinyl, aluminum, rustic and/or unpainted wood siding, stud wall lumber, embossed wood grain materials. Stone, board-and-batten and half-timbering are uncommon cladding materials in Germantown and are generally not appropriate.
  - Texture and tooling of mortar on new construction should be similar to historic examples.
  - Four inch (4”) nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner for non-masonry walls.
  - Belt courses or a change in materials from one story to another are often encouraged for large two-story buildings to break up the massing. When different wall materials are used, it is most appropriate to have such changes occur at floor lines.
- g. Accent and Trim Materials:
- Appropriate materials: wood or fiber cement
  - Shingle siding is appropriate as an accent material and should exhibit a straight-line course pattern or a fish scale pattern and exhibit a maximum exposure of seven inches (7”).
  - Wood trim and accents were typically painted and milled. Rustic timbers and unpainted wood is generally inappropriate.
  - Composite materials may be appropriate for trim if they match the visual and durability characteristics of wood.
  - Stucco/parge coating may be appropriate cladding for a new chimney or a foundation.
- h. Roofs and Chimneys Materials:
- Appropriate roof materials: Asphalt shingle and standing seam metal Generally, asphalt shingle roofing should not have strong simulated shadows in the granule colors which results in a rough, pitted appearance; faux shadow lines; strongly variegated colors; colors that are light (e.g.: tan, white, light green); wavy or deep color/texture used to simulate split shake shingles or slate; excessive flared form in the shingle tabs; uneven or sculpted bottom edges that emphasize tab width or edges, unless matching the original roof.
  - Rolled roofing material, such as EPDM, is appropriate for low-sloped roof planes that are not visible from the right-of-way.
  - Appropriate chimney materials: masonry or stucco.
  - Inappropriate chimney materials: clapboard/lap siding.
- i. Door & Window Materials:
- Front doors shall be painted or stained wood or painted metal and be at least half-glass.
  - Tinted, reflective, or colored glass are generally inappropriate for windows or doors.
  - For new commercial structures a significant portion of the street level façade (i.e., doors and windows) shall be transparent to provide visual interest and pedestrian access.

- Windows on residential buildings or upper level facades of commercial/mixed-use buildings may be fixed, casement, single or double hung window sashes. Single-light (also known as 1/1) window sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes.
  - Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows and vents on non-masonry buildings. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between.
  - Brick molding is required around doors, windows and vents within masonry walls. The use of brick molding on non-masonry buildings is inappropriate.
  - Door openings should be recessed (2" minimum) on masonry buildings, as they are traditionally, rather than flush with the rest of the wall.
- j. Walkways, Sidewalks & Curbing Materials:
- For the purpose of these design guidelines, "sidewalks" are those that parallel the street in the public realm and "walkways" are typically on private property and lead from the sidewalk to a principal entrance.
  - Materials for new appurtenances should be in keeping with the look, feel and workability of existing historic materials.
  - New sidewalks shall be brick, with the exception of sidewalks on Rosa L. Parks Blvd and Jefferson Street, which may be brick or concrete.
  - Brick, concreted, concrete pavers, stone and stepping stones are appropriate walkway materials.
  - Planting strips are not appropriate in the interior of the district but may be appropriate on Rosa L. Parks Blvd.
- k. Front Yard Fencing and Walls:
- Front yard fences can be up to 4' in height and shall generally have an open design.
  - Appropriate materials: wood picket, metal fencing of simple design. Stone is an appropriate material for retaining walls. New stone should match existing historic retaining walls with characteristics similar in scale, design, finish, texture, durability, and detailing.
  - Inappropriate materials: chain link or women fences are generally not appropriate for front or visible side yards. Salvaged metal fencing and dry stack masonry are not appropriate for new construction.
- l. Rear Yard Fencing and Walls:
- A rear yard is considered to be any location beyond the mid-point on the side facades of a building and surrounding the rear yard.
- Appropriate materials: wood planks, iron, and masonry and mortar may be appropriate along rear property lines. Stone with mortar and concrete are appropriate materials for retaining walls. New stone should match existing historic retaining walls with characteristics similar in scale, design, finish, texture, durability, and detailing.
  - Inappropriate materials: Dry-stack masonry
  - Privacy fences in rear yards can be up to 6' in height and solid in design.

**Background:** 1309 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North is newly constructed house, one story tall in the front and two stories in the rear, with a one and one-half-story outbuilding behind the house.



Figure 1. New construction at 1309 6<sup>th</sup> Ave. N.

The design of the building was approved by the MHZC on March 20, 2019. A condition of approval was that the brick be approved prior to purchase and installation. This requirement was repeated in the permit (2019-014004) both on the cover page and as notes on the drawing. Additional conditions were that window, door, roof color, brick, and stone selections would be approved by staff prior to installation.

The structure has been largely completed at this time. The following materials were submitted for review via email and were approved with email confirmation:

Component	Selection	Date Approved
Windows	Marvin Wood and/or Fiberglass	October 18, 2019
Front door	Custom, glass with steel frame and internal steel muntins.	January 28, 2020
Courtyard floor	“Winbourne” Limestone	July 23, 2020
Porch Floor	Concrete	July 23, 2020

Staff does not have a record of a request for review or approval of the color of the standing seam metal roof or the brick selection.

**Roofing:** The installed roofing material is a black or dark gray standing seam metal. Standing seam is an appropriate material, and dark roofs are typical of historic houses in the surrounding area.

Staff finds the installed roofing to meet Section III.E.5. of the design guidelines.

**Masonry:** The installed brick is tan or taupe. The design guidelines specify that “masonry should be similar to historic colors of the same or similar materials. Traditional brick colors range from red-oranges to dark red.”

Staff finds the installed brick does not meet Section III.E.5. of the design guidelines.

Painting brick is generally discouraged in the Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay; however, because the brick is not historic and has already been installed, staff finds that recoloring the brick to be in the range from red-orange to dark red would make for a more appropriate infill at 1309 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North. Staff recommends a stain be used

rather than paint to allow for the texture of the brick and mortar remain as much as possible and the chosen color be approved by staff prior to purchase.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the installed roof color shall be approved. Staff recommends that the brick shall be stained a red color more compatible with the colors of surrounding historic houses, with the color selection to be approved by MHZC staff prior to application.



## ATTACHMENT A: PHOTOGRAPHS



New construction at 1309 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, recent photo.



1307 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, to the left of 1309 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North.





1311 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, to the right of 1309 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North.



View across the street from 1309 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North.